



Ein cyf/Our ref ATISN 12130

27 March 2018

Dear ,

Thank you for your request which I received on 27 February 2018 about Deposit Return Schemes. You requested the following information:

- A copy of the Extended Producer Responsibility report commissioned by the Welsh Government and compiled by Eunomia that was due for publication in February 2018.
- Copies of all correspondence from Ministers and civil servants in Welsh Government over the last 12 months between the Scottish Government and themselves regarding a Deposit Return Scheme.
- Copies of all correspondence from the Ministers and civil servants in Welsh Government over the last 12 months between the UK Government and themselves regarding a Deposit Return Scheme.
- Copies of all correspondence from the drinks industry in the last 12 months to Welsh Government in relation to a Deposit Return Scheme.

The majority of the information I have decided can be released under this request is already available on our website. Please use the following link to access the information:

<http://gov.wales/about/foi/responses/2018/Mar18/atish11909/?lang=en>

A copy of additional information I have decided to release is enclosed in Annex 2.

I have decided that some of the information described in the enclosed list is exempt from disclosure under Regulation 12(4)(d), Regulation 12(4)(e) and Regulation 13 of the Environmental Information Regulations and is therefore withheld. The reasons for applying these exceptions are set out in full at Annex 4 to this letter.

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

If you are dissatisfied with the Welsh Government's handling of your request, you can ask for an internal review within 40 working days of the date of this response. Requests for an internal review should be addressed to the Welsh Government's Freedom of Information Officer at:

Information Rights Unit
Welsh Government
Cathays Park
Cardiff
CF10 3NQ

or email: FreedomOfInformationOfficer@wales.gsi.gov.uk

Please remember to quote the ATISN reference number above.

You also have the right to complain to the Information Commissioner. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF

However, please note that the Commissioner will not normally investigate a complaint until it has been through our own internal review process.

Yours sincerely

Annex 1

I have decided to withhold the following information:

Information being withheld	Section number and exemption name of the Environmental Information Regulations 2004
A copy of the draft report from Eunomia on Extended Producer Responsibility.	Regulation 12(4)(d) the request relates to material which is still in the course of completion, to unfinished documents or to incomplete data.
Correspondence sent by and between Welsh Government Ministers, officials and Special Advisers to and from the Scottish and UK Governments regarding Deposit Return Schemes.	Regulation 12(4)(d) the request relates to material which is still in the course of completion, to unfinished documents or to incomplete data.
Internal correspondence between Welsh Government Ministers, officials and Special Advisers regarding Deposit Return Schemes	Regulation 12(4)(e) the request involves the disclosure of internal communications.
Names and addresses of: - all members of the public, including constituents whose correspondence was forwarded by an AM or MP - non public facing civil servants - non public facing officers of external organisations - retired officers of organisations or people who have since left the organisation	Regulation (13) the information requested includes personal data of which the applicant is not the data subject

This Annex sets out the reasons for the engagement of Regulation 12(4)(d), Regulation 12(4)(e) and Regulation (13) of the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 and our subsequent consideration of the Public Interest Test.

Engagement of Regulations 12(4)(d) and 12(4)(e) of the Environmental Information Regulations 2004

Regulation 12(4)(d) states:

...a public authority may refuse to disclose information to the extent that—

(d) the request relates to material which is still in the course of completion, to unfinished documents or to incomplete data.

These terms are not defined in EIRs but ICO guidance is that material which is still in the course of completion can include information created as part of the process of formulating and developing policy, where the process is not complete.

Regulation 12(4)(e) states:

... a public authority may refuse to disclose information to the extent that—

(e) the request involves the disclosure of internal communications.

Guidance from the Information Commissioner has confirmed that this exception is drafted broadly and is a class based exception which covers *all* internal communications, not just those that are sensitive or actually reflect internal thinking. The concept of 'internal communications' covers a wide range of information and includes any information intended to be communicated to others or saved in a file where it may be consulted by others. I can confirm that the information held by the Welsh Government which is captured by your request amounts to internal communications.

Public Interest Test

In order to satisfy the public interest test in relation to the exemption(s), it is necessary to conclude that the public interest arguments in favour of withholding the information are sufficient to *outweigh* the public interest arguments in favour of release.

Public interest arguments in favour of disclosure

The Welsh Government acknowledges the presumption in favour of disclosure under Regulation 12(2) and we acknowledge there is a public interest in openness and transparency within Government. There is a public interest in understanding how the Welsh Government is developing policy related to DRS. Disclosure would increase public trust in, and engagement with, the Welsh Government.

Public interest arguments in favour of withholding

Disclosure would harm the interests of the Welsh Government by leading to the loss of frankness and candour with other government administrations and would be likely to damage any future deliberations around developing our policy. It is important for good governance that officials are able to fully engage and exchange sensitive information and advice away from the public gaze and that there should be no disincentive in doing so.

The Welsh Government believes correspondence sent by Welsh Government Ministers, officials and Special Advisers to officers of the consultancy Eunomia regarding research on Extended Producer Responsibility for food and drink packaging should be exempt from disclosure. The policy in this area is currently in development and incomplete and the Welsh Government will need to review all available evidence and policy options in a balanced way to develop this policy and to ensure the accuracy of the information contained in the report.

The Welsh Government believes correspondence sent by Welsh Government Ministers, officials and Special Advisers to the Scottish Government and UK Government regarding Deposit Return Schemes should be exempt from disclosure. The Welsh Government has entered into a free and frank exchange of views with other UK government administrations and agencies which will inform our policy making on Deposit Return Schemes and could form the basis of collaborative policy development with them. Disclosure would likely lead to the loss of frankness and candour with these stakeholders and likely damage any future deliberations.

The Welsh Government believes internal correspondence between Welsh Government Ministers, officials and Special Advisers regarding Deposit Return Schemes should be exempt from disclosure. The policy in this area is currently in development and incomplete and the Welsh Government will need to review all available evidence and policy options in a balanced way to develop this policy and to ensure the accuracy of the information contained in the report.

Balance of public interest test

We believe that disclosing all correspondence sent by Ministers, officials, or Special Advisers to Assembly Members, Members of Parliament, members of the public or other stakeholders such as businesses or third sector organisations is in the public interest as it will increase public trust in and engagement with the Welsh Government. We also believe the public interest in avoiding loss of frankness and candour with stakeholders and creating confusion about Welsh Government policy which is still in development, outweigh the benefits of disclosing all correspondence with other government administrations, agencies and the consultancy which is working on advice on Extended Producer Responsibility for food and drink packaging. The Welsh Government believes the balance of public interest to withhold some of the information outweighs the public interest to release it for the reasons outlined above. The information has therefore been withheld under Regulation 12(4)(d) and 12(4)(e) of the EIRs.

Engagement of Regulation 13 of the Environmental Information Regulations 2004

Regulation 13 of the EIRs sets out an exception from the duty to disclose if the information requested is personal information protected by the Data Protection Act 1998 (DPA). Personal data is defined in Section 1(1) of the DPA as:

“personal data” means data which relates to a living individual who can be identified from those data; or from those data and other information which is in the possession of, or is likely to come into the possession of, the data controller.

I consider that information regarding names and addresses of members of the public, constituents whose correspondence was forwarded by an AM or MP, officers of external organisations and civil servants clearly falls within the description of personal data as defined by the DPA and that its disclosure would breach the first data protection principle.

The first data protection principle has two components:

1. Personal data shall be processed fairly and lawfully and
2. Personal data shall not be processed unless at least one of the conditions in DPA schedule 2 is met.

Guidance from the Information Commissioner's Office (Personal information (section 40 and regulation 13) v 1.3) states (at p11):

- *The starting point is to consider whether it would be fair to the data subject to disclose their personal data. The key considerations in assessing this are set out in the section on Fairness below.*
- *If disclosure would not be fair, then the information is exempt from disclosure.*

This approach was endorsed by the Court of Appeal in the case of *Deborah Clark v the Information Commissioner and East Hertfordshire District Council* where it was held:

“The first data protection principle entails a consideration of whether it would be fair to disclose the personal data in all the circumstances. The Commissioner determined that it would not be fair to disclose the requested information and thus the first data protection principle would be breached. There was no need in the present case therefore to consider whether any other Schedule 2 condition or conditions could be met because even if such conditions could be established, it would still not be possible to disclose the personal data without breaching the DPA” (paragraph 63).

Release of information under the EIRs is not release to the requestor, but release to the world. Members of the public identified in correspondence with AMs would have had no reasonable expectation that their correspondence would be published to the world, and as such, release of their personal data would constitute unfair processing under the DPA.

Additionally, the ICO has issued guidance on whether release of names of officials and employees named in correspondence would be unfair, and thus in breach of the first principle of the Data Protection Act 1998. The guidance states:

In assessing whether employees can have a reasonable expectation that their names will not be disclosed, key factors will include their level of seniority and responsibility and whether they have a public facing role where they represent the authority to the outside world.

Where the officials in question are not senior staff, do not have a public facing role and where they are acting entirely in an administrative capacity, I have concluded that they have a reasonable expectation that their names will not be disclosed. It is my view, therefore, that disclosure of their names would breach the first data protection principle, and thus are exempt from release under regulation 13 of the Environmental Information Regulations 2004.

Annex 2

From: NAME REDACTED@britglass.co.uk
Sent: 21 February 2018 12:05
To: NAME REDACTED
Cc: NAMES REDACTED
Subject: Invite to glass deposit return scheme workshop

Dear all,

I am pleased to announce that a workshop to explore the *Impact of Deposit Return Schemes on Glass Packaging* will be held on **Wed 21st March**. Please confirm your attendance by accepting my meeting request or sending me an e mail.

Location: The workshop is likely to be held in the Stockport area as its transport links help those travelling from other parts of the country and abroad – we will confirm as soon as we can.

Attendees: There has been good interest from across the supply chain including representatives from glass manufacturing, recycling, fillers & brands, retail, central government, local authority, compliance scheme operators and consultants. We will limit the workshop to about 20 people and try to ensure that as many of the key stakeholder groups are represented.

Agenda: We will develop and circulate an agenda in the next couple of weeks.

Please feel free to contact me if you wish to discuss.

Warm regards
NAME REDACTED

From: NAME REDACTED
Subject: Invite to glass deposit return scheme workshop

Dear all,

We are organising a stakeholder workshop to explore the impacts of introducing a deposit return scheme (DRS) in the UK, on glass packaging. We hope to identify which issues need to be considered in the design of DRS systems in order to maximise close loop recycling and minimise negative impacts to packaging markets.

- If you or a colleague would like to participate, please indicate your availability by **Thursday 15th Feb**:
<https://doodle.com/poll/2uvncifqkdmzc5ue>
- You are also welcome to contact me to discuss.

Background

In 2018, governments will decide whether to introduce DRS in England, Scotland and Wales. DRS may have a big impact on glass packaging markets and glass recycling. We believe it is important to understand the benefits and identify any unforeseen consequences so that these can be fed into the decision making discussions on DRS schemes.

The workshop will take place in March 2018, will be free and located in the Sheffield area. We welcome interested stakeholders from across the supply chain, including glass manufacturers, recyclers, fillers, brand owners, retailers, government advisors, and local authorities to join us.

This workshop on DRS is part of the development of a wider strategy to identify the best ways to increase close loop glass recycling in the UK.

Warm regards

NAME REDACTED

Environmental Adviser

British Glass Manufacturers' Confederation

9 Churchill Way, Sheffield, S35 2PY

Tel Switchboard: +44 (0) 114 290 1850

MOBILE NUMBER REDACTED

E-mail: info@britglass.co.uk www.britglass.org.uk

This Company (No. 539065) is Registered in England and Limited by Guarantee. Registered office is at the above address.

Stay in touch...

Be the first to hear about British Glass news, events, training and more – [join our mailing list](#)



British Glass

www.britglass.org.uk

British Glass represents the interests of primary glass manufacturers and the glass supply-chain – from raw materials to the end-user.

Registered address: 9 Churchill Way, Chapeltown, Sheffield, S35 2PY.

Company Number: 539065 – registered in England and limited by guarantee.



Confidentiality notice: This message (and any associated files) is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential, subject to copyright or constitutes a trade secret. If you are not the intended recipient you are hereby notified that any dissemination, copying or distribution of this message, or files associated with this message, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify us immediately by replying to the message and deleting it from your computer. Messages sent to and from us may be monitored. Internet communications cannot be guaranteed to be secure or error-free as information could be intercepted, corrupted, lost, destroyed, arrive late or incomplete, or contain viruses. Therefore, we do not accept responsibility for any errors or omissions that are present in this message, or any attachment, that have arisen as a result of e-mail transmission. If verification is required, please request a hard-copy version. Any views or opinions presented are solely those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the company.

From: Julie Byers [mailto:julie.byers@acs.org.uk]
Sent: 20 February 2018 12:06
To: Rees, Andy (ESNR - ERA - Water, Waste, Resource Efficiency &Flood)
Subject: RE: ACS Meeting

Hi Andy

Great – I actually have a meeting before at 11am in Cathays Park so that works for me.

Kind regards,
Julie

Julie Byers

Public Affairs Manager
Association of Convenience Stores
DL: 01252 533008
M: 07387 262277
www.acs.org.uk

From: Andy.Rees@gov.wales [mailto:Andy.Rees@gov.wales]
Sent: 20 February 2018 11:48
To: Julie Byers <julie.byers@acs.org.uk>
Subject: RE: ACS Meeting

Hi Julie,

I'm free at 12 o'clock, would you be able to come to our office in Cathays Park?

Thanks
Andy

Dr Andy Rees, Head of Waste Strategy Branch
Water, Waste, Resource Efficiency & Flood Division/ Yr Is-adran Dŵr, Gwastraff, Effeithlonrwydd Adnoddau a Llifogydd
Department for Natural Resources / Yr Adran Cyfoeth Naturiol
Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru
Cathays Park/Parc Cathays
Cardiff/Caerdydd CF10 3NQ
Tel: 0300 025 1605
email/ebost/ andy.rees@gov.wales

From: Julie Byers [mailto:julie.byers@acs.org.uk]
Sent: 20 February 2018 11:45
To: Rees, Andy (ESNR - ERA - Water, Waste, Resource Efficiency &Flood)
Subject: Re: ACS Meeting

Hi Andy,

I'm actually in Cardiff on 26th February if you're free for a catch up at 12 or any time after 2?

Kind regards,
Julie

Julie Byers

Public Affairs Manager
Association of Convenience Stores
DL: 01252 533008
M: 07387 262277
www.acs.org.uk

From: Julie Byers
Sent: 31 January 2018 17:50
To: 'Andy.Rees@wales.gsi.gov.uk' <Andy.Rees@wales.gsi.gov.uk>
Subject: ACS Meeting

Hi Andy,

I hope this email finds you well.

Given that there has been a lot of discussions about DRS recently, I was wondering if there would be an opportunity to catch up in the next few weeks? In particular, it would be interesting to find out the current status of the Welsh Government's research on DRS and if there are still plans to pilot it in Wales.

I look forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards,
Julie

Julie Byers
Public Affairs Manager
Association of Convenience Stores
DL: 01252 533008
M: 07387 262277
www.acs.org.uk

Association of Convenience Stores Limited
Federation House, 17 Farnborough Street
Farnborough, Hampshire, GU14 8AG
Tel. 01252 515001
Website. www.acs.org.uk

Registered in England at the above address. Registration number 3987067

DISCLAIMER: This e-mail and any attached files are confidential and may be legally privileged. Any disclosure, reproduction, copying, distribution, or other dissemination or use of this communication is strictly prohibited if not previously approved by ACS. If you have received this transmission in error please notify ACS immediately and then delete this e-mail. This communication does not constitute any formal commitment on behalf of ACS.

Wrth adael Llywodraeth Cymru sganiwyd y neges yma am bob feirws. Mae'n bosibl y bydd gohebiaeth gyda Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael ei logio, ei monitro ac/neu ei chofnodi yn awtomatig am resymau cyfreithiol. Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi. On leaving the Welsh Government this email was scanned for all known viruses. Communications with Welsh Government may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes. We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.