

Request 1

An update on the current status of Lord Murphy of Torfaen's independent review of conservatoire and performing arts provision in Wales ("the Murphy review"). Please include the reason for delays.

Response:

This is not a freedom of information request. A written update was provided to the Children, Young People and Education Committee, which is in the public domain and published on the National Assembly of Wales website. This is accessible from the link below:

<http://senedd.assembly.wales/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=443&MId=4313&Ver=4>

Request 2

A list of dates and locations of meetings, consultation events, or other events ("in-person events") held under the purview of the Murphy review:

	Date	Name/ attendees	Venue
1	05/04/16	Minister for Education and Skills Minister for Economy, Science and Transport Dewi Knight Lord Paul Murphy John Myerscough Neil Surman Peter Owen officials	Minister's Office, Ty Howel, Cardiff Bay
2	26/04/16	Natasha Hale John Myerscough	Cardiff location
3	11/05/16	Lord Rowe-Beddoe John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy	House of Lords, London
4	13/05/16	Hilary Boulding, Principal RWCMD RWCMD Management Team John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	The Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama
5	27/05/16	Student Union, RWCMD Peter Harris Brian Weir John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Student Union Meeting Room/ The Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama
6	10/06/16	Sir Ian Diamond John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London

	Date	Name/ attendees	Venue
7	16/06/16	Dame Janet Ritterman, Independent Board member of RWCMD Mark Taylor, Independent Board member of RWCMD John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff. Room: Ynys Mon
8	17/06/16	Helene Mansfield, Chair of the College Governors John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Dining Room 3 booked
9	17/06/16	Ron Jones Ed Thomas, Vice President of the Royal Welsh College of Music John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff Room: Dining room 3
10	24/06/16	David Allen, HEFCW Chair David Blaney, HEFCW CEO John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays , Cardiff Room: Dining Room 3
11	24/06/16	Nick Capaldi, CEO, Arts Council Wales Phil George, Chair of the Arts Council Wales John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff Room: Dining room 2
12	28/06/16	Hilary Boulding – Principal Dr John Cranmer – Director of Music Sean Crowley – Director of Drama Scott Allin – Vice Principal John Myerscough Lord Paul Murphy officials	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London.
13	29/06/16	Menna Richards Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London.
14	29/06/16	Geraint Talfan Davies (Chairman WNO) Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London.
15	29/06/16	David Pountney (WNO Artistic Director) Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London.
16	14/07/16	Lord Murphy John Myerscough	Radar University
17	18/07/16	Professor Kenneth Hamilton, Head of School of Music, Cardiff University Lord Murphy	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London.

	Date	Name/ attendees	Venue
		John Myerscough	
18	21/07/16	Julie Lydon, Vice Chancellor USW Gareth Williams, Chairman USW Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Victoria Street, London.
19	22/07/16	Julie Lydon, Vice Chancellor USW Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	University of South Wales (ATRIUM Building) 86-88 Adam Street Cardiff CF24 2FN
20	28/07/16	Cabinet Secretary for Education Tom Woodward Lord Murphy John Myerscough Neil Surman officials	Minister's Office, Ty Howel, Cardiff Bay
21	04/08/16	Christine Lewis Gareth Pierce Both on behalf of the Interim Board of National Youth Arts Wales (NYAW) Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff Room: Tregaron
22	04/08/16	Dr Chris Collins, Head of School of Music, Bangor University, Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff Room: Dining Room 2
23	08/08/16	Chris Nott, Previous Chair of RWCMD (2007) John Myerscough officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff. Room: Ynys Mon
24	19/09/16	Lord Murphy John Myerscough officials Dewi Knight Neil Surman	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff. Room Dinning Room 2
25	20/09/16	Cabinet Secretary for Education Tom Woodward Lord Murphy John Myerscough Neil Surman officials	Minister's Office, Ty Howel, Cardiff Bay
26	14/10/17	Lord Murphy John Myerscough Dewi Knight Neil Surman officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff
27	5/12/16	Lord Murphy John Myerscough Dewi Knight	Welsh Government Office, Cathays, Cardiff

	Date	Name/ attendees	Venue
		Neil Surman officials	
28	15/12/16	Cabinet Secretary for Education Dewi Knight Gareth Williams Neil Surman officials	Minister's Office, Ty Howel, Cardiff Bay
29	13/01/17	Lord Murphy John Myerscough Neil Surman officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays Park, Cardiff
30	08/02/17	Neil Surman Julie Lydon Gareth Williams officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays Park, Cardiff
31	15/02/17	Cabinet Secretary for Education Dewi Knight Lord Murphy John Myerscough Neil Surman officials	Cabinet Secretary's Office, Ty Hywel
32	06/03/17	John Myerscough Chris Jones officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays Park, Cardiff
33	04/05/17	Cabinet Secretary for Education Brian Weir Michelle Lowe Dewi Knight Neil Surman officials	Cabinet Secretary's Office, Ty Hywel
34	25/05/17	Lord Murphy Professor Julie Lydon Gareth Williams Neil Surman Dewi Knight officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays Park, Cardiff
35	21/06/17	Professor Julie Lydon Gareth Williams Neil Surman Dewi Knight officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays Park, Cardiff
36	26/06/17	Lord Murphy John Myerscough Dewi Knight Neil Surman officials	Welsh Government Office, Cathays Park, Cardiff
37	14/07/17	Cabinet Secretary for Education Lord Murphy John Myerscough Dewi Knight Neil Surman officials	Dining Room 3, Ty Howel, Cardiff Bay
38	18/10/17	First Minister	Ty Howell, Cardiff

	Date	Name/ attendees	Venue
		Cabinet Secretary for Education Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Infrastructure Neil Surman officials	Bay
39	18/10/17	RWCMD Student Union	Ty Howell, Cardiff Bay

Request 3

List of Names of those who attended in person events under the purview of the Murphy Review- broken down by event:

05/05/16 Minister for Education and Skills, Minister for Economy, Science and Transport, Dewi Knight, Lord Paul Murphy, John Myerscough, Neil Surman, Peter Owen and officials

26/04/16 Natasha Hale, John Myerscough;

11/05/16 Lord Rowe-Beddoe, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough;

13/05/16 Hilary Boulding, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

17/05/16 Peter Harris & Brian Weir, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

10/06/16 Sir Ian Diamond, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough;

16/06/16 Dame Janet Ritterman, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

17/06/16 Helene Mansfield, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

17/06/16 Ron Jones & Ed Thomas, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

24/06/16 David Allen & David Blaney, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

24/06/16 Nick Capaldi & Phil George, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

28/06/16 Hilary Boulding, Dr John Cranmer, Sean Crowley & Scott Allin, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

29/06/16 Menna Richards, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

29/06/16 Geraint Talfan Davies, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

29/06/16 David Pountney, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

14/07/16 Radar University, Lord Murphy and John Myerscough;

18/07/16 Professor Kenneth Hamilton, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough;

21/07/16 Julie Lydon & Gareth Williams, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

22/07/16 Julie Lydon, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

28/07/16 Cabinet Secretary for Education, Tom Woodward, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Neil Surman and officials

04/08/16 Christine Lewis & Gareth Pierce, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

04/08/16 Dr Chris Collins, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

08/08/16 Chris Nott, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

19/09/16 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials;

20/09/16 Cabinet Secretary for Education, Tom Woodward, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Neil Surman;

14/10/16 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials;

05/12/16 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials;

15/12/16 Cabinet Secretary for Education, Dewi Knight, Gareth Williams, Neil Surman and officials;

13/01/17 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Neil Surman and officials;

15/02/17 Cabinet Secretary for Education, Dewi Knight, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Neil Surman;

06/03/17 John Myerscough, Chris Jones and officials;

04/05/17 Cabinet Secretary for Education, Brian Weir, Michelle Lowe, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials;

25/05/17 Professor Julie Lydon & Gareth Williams, Lord Murphy and officials;

21/06/17 Professor Julie Lydon & Gareth Williams, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

26/06/17 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials;

14/07/17 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials;

18/10/17 RWCMD Student Union, Lord Murphy, John Myerscough and officials;

18/10/17 Lord Murphy, John Myerscough, Dewi Knight, Neil Surman and officials.

Request 5

Copies of correspondence between any Welsh Government ministers or officials and Lord Murphy of Torfaen, relating to the Murphy Review:

Email correspondence:

From: Paul Murphy
Sent: 25 January 2017 15:52
To: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Review: meetings

XXX

February 15 fine for me.

Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 25 Jan 2017, at 15:31, (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) wrote:

Hi both

I have been liaising with private office for the meeting with the Cabinet Secretary. When we last met Lord Murphy indicated that possible dates were between 14-17 February. Are you still free on any of these dates? The Cabinet Secretary may have an available slot on the 15 February – is this convenient for you?

Thanks

XXX

From: John Myerscough
Sent: 24 January 2017 14:26
To: Lord MURPHY OF TORFAEN
Cc: Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Review: meetings

Dear Paul

Following this morning's meeting, I rang the office.

Neil is off ill today but I spoke to XXX about the need to fix Neil's meeting with USW soon, lest there be any loss of momentum in the Murphy process. You suggested early February, and not later than the second week. As agreed, you should be seeing XXX alone in advance of Neil's meeting. You could do that on 6 February (10am-1.30pm).

You were also looking for a meeting with the Cabinet Secretary later in February or early March. You mentioned a.m. 27 and 28 February, and late p.m. 2 March as possibilities. I can do those, but 3 March, which you also mentioned, is looking difficult for me.

The office will be back to you on this.

Good to see you this morning.

All best

John

On leaving the Government Secure Intranet this email was certified virus free.
Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or
recorded for legal purposes.

Wrth adael Mewnwyd Ddiogel y Llywodraeth nid oedd unrhyw feirws yn
gysylltiedig â'r neges hon. Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd unrhyw ohebiaeth drwy'r
GSi yn cael ei logio, ei monitro a/neu ei chofnodi yn awtomatig am resymau
cyfreithiol.

From: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Sent: 26 January 2017 13:03
To: 'John Myerscough'; 'Lord MURPHY OF TORFAEN'; 'Paul Murphy'
Cc: Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -
HE Division)
Subject: RE: Review: meetings

Hi both

Just to update you that a meeting has been arranged with Welsh Government
officials, XXX and XXX for 8th February.

I am still awaiting confirmation from private office as to Lord Murphy's meeting with
the Cabinet Secretary on 15 February but will update you in due course.

Kind regards

XXX

From: John Myerscough
Sent: 24 January 2017 14:26
To: Lord MURPHY OF TORFAEN
Cc: Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division);
XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Review: meetings

Dear Paul

Following this morning's meeting, I rang the office.

Neil is off ill today but I spoke to XXX about the need to fix Neil's meeting with USW
soon, lest there be any loss of momentum in the Murphy process. You suggested
early February, and not later than the second week.

As agreed, you should be seeing XXX alone in advance of Neil's meeting. You could do that on 6 February (10am-1.30pm).

You were also looking for a meeting with the Cabinet Secretary later in February or early March. You mentioned a.m. 27 and 28 February, and late p.m. 2 March as possibilities. I can do those, but 3 March, which you also mentioned, is looking difficult for me.

The office will be back to you on this.

Good to see you this morning.

All best

John

.....

From: MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord
Sent: 01 February 2017 16:24
To: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Cc: John Myerscough; Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Review: meetings

9.30am would be great for a conference call on

Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 1 Feb 2017, at 12:18, (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) wrote:

Dear John

Many thanks for this.

Neil is free anytime between 9am – 10:30m on the 9th for a tele-com

He will come back to you separately about the briefing.

I hope this is ok.

Kind regards
XXX

From: John Myerscough
Sent: 01 February 2017 10:56
To: (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)

Cc: Lord MURPHY OF TORFAEN; Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division);
(ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Review: meetings

Dear XXX

Lord Murphy and I met yesterday. Given XXX reply, he suggests we drop the idea of a pre-meeting, and go straight to the meeting of the officials with XXX and XXX on 8 February.

We will need to take stock of the outcome of this meeting on the following day, the 9th, with a conference call between Neil, Lord Murphy, and myself. We could do 9am-10.30am or 12.30pm. Perhaps this is something which could be arranged at the Welsh Government office?

Could Neil give me a call for a little more background?

Has he had any further thoughts about briefing before the 8th?

Best wishes
John

On leaving the Government Secure Intranet this email was certified virus free.
Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

Wrth adael Mewnwyd Ddiogel y Llywodraeth nid oedd unrhyw feirws yn gysylltiedig â'r neges hon. Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd unrhyw ohebiaeth drwy'r GSi yn cael ei logio, ei monitro a/neu ei chofnodi yn awtomatig am resymau cyfreithiol.

UK Parliament Disclaimer: This e-mail is confidential to the intended recipient. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender and delete it from your system. Any unauthorised use, disclosure, or copying is not permitted. This e-mail has been checked for viruses, but no liability is accepted for any damage caused by any virus transmitted by this e-mail. This e-mail address is not secure, is not encrypted and should not be used for sensitive data.

From: MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord
Sent: 21 February 2017 13:55
To: John Myerscough
Cc: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Review: dates for 3-way meeting

Dear John,

Try these:-

March 13 - am in Wales
March 15- am in London
March 16 - pm in Wales
March 17 - all day in Wales
March 20 - am in Wales
March 21. - am in London

March 22 - am in London

Speaking tonight on the EU Bill!

Yours,
Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 21 Feb 2017, at 10:46, John Myerscough wrote:

Dear Paul

My meeting with officials has now been fixed for 6 March. Re your dates, could you look a little further forward in your diary, as we won't now be able to use a number of those on your list?

Hope you're enjoying the Great Debate!

Best

John

From: MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord

Sent: Friday, February 17, 2017 9:22 AM

To: John Myerscough

Cc: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)

Subject: Re: Review: report draft 3: IN CONFIDENCE

Dear John,

Some possible meeting dates:-

Cardiff:

March 2 - 3pm on

March 3 - 12.30 pm on

March 6 - morning

March 10 - 3pm on

London:

February 23 - afternoon

February 28 - all day

March 7 - morning

March 8 - morning

March 9 - afternoon.

I hope this is of some use.

Paul

Sent from my iPad

On 14 Feb 2017, at 12:12, John Myerscough wrote:

Dear XXX

Here is draft 3 for inclusion in the briefing papers you are sending to the Cabinet Secretary.

A lot of work has been done on Sections 4 and 5, and there are still some important decisions to make about the line to be adopted in Section 5. We can explain the issues tomorrow.

Look forward to seeing you.

All best

John

<Wales Rpt Feb17.doc> (attachment redacted)

UK Parliament Disclaimer: This e-mail is confidential to the intended recipient. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender and delete it from your system. Any unauthorised use, disclosure, or copying is not permitted. This e-mail has been checked for viruses, but no liability is accepted for any damage caused by any virus transmitted by this e-mail. This e-mail address is not secure, is not encrypted and should not be used for sensitive data.

From: MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord
Sent: 09 May 2017 11:58
To: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Meeting with USW - 10 May

Yes please
Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 9 May 2017, at 10:46, XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) wrote:

Hi Paul, yes in Cathays Park. Do you need a car parking space?

Thanks

XXX

From: MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord
Sent: 09 May 2017 10:12
To: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Cc: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Meeting with USW - 10 May

Great! In Cathays Park, I assume?

Paul

Sent from my iPhone

On 9 May 2017, at 09:18, XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) wrote:

Hi Paul

Apologies for the delay, XXX PA was on leave. She has just confirmed that both XXX and XXX are now able to make 25 May at 14:30, in Cardiff – is this still suitable for you?

Kind regards

XXX

From: (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)

Sent: 12 June 2017 13:56

To: 'Paul Murphy'; 'MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord'

Cc: (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)

Subject: Re: Telephone call with Neil - RWCMD

Dear Lord Murphy

XXX has been in touch with Neil with some initial comments about your draft report.

Neil would like to discuss this with you in the first instance and is asking if you available anytime this week for a 20/30 minute discrete telephone call?

Mornings are most suitable for Neil.

Kind regards

XXX

Is-Adran Addysg Uwch/ Higher Education Division

Sgiliau, Addysg Uwch a Dysgu Gydol Oes/ Skills, Higher Education and Lifelong Learning

From: (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)

Sent: 07 June 2017 12:59

To: 'Paul Murphy'; John Myerscough

Cc: ; (ESNR-SHELL -HE

Division); Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)

Subject: RE: Meeting Dates - RWCMD Review

Hi Paul

Friday 14th July is workable for the Cabinet Secretary between 15:00-15:30 – is this ok with you.

John will you be attending too?

Kind regards

XXX

From: Paul Murphy
Sent: 06 June 2017 17:50
To: (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Cc: Paul Murphy John Myerscough; XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Meeting Dates - RWCMD Review

E mails have crossed!

A meeting before June 21 is more difficult, because of the Election and the State Opening. I can do June 16 anytime in Cardiff; otherwise, we'll have to do something over the phone.

With regard to meeting Kirsty, can I suggest the following possibilities:-

June 23 pm

June 26 am

July 3 am

July 7 anytime

July 10 am

July 14 after 2.30 pm

July 17 am

July 21 anytime

I hope one of these works.

Paul

Sent from my iPad

On 6 Jun 2017, at 15:02, XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) wrote:

Hi both

We have arranged a meeting with officials, XXX and XXX on the 21st June to establish their initial views of sections of the report that we shared with them. In the meantime Neil has suggested we have a catch up meeting with you both either in person or by telephone prior to that date – can you provide some dates/ times and attendance preference?

We also need to arrange a date for you to meet the Cabinet Secretary to update her on progress, hopefully the end of June/ early July – can you let me know your availability so that I can check with private office?

Thanks for your help

Kind regards

XXX

Is-Adran Addysg Uwch/ Higher Education Division
Sgiliau, Addysg Uwch a Dysgu Gydol Oes/ Skills, Higher Education and
Lifelong Learning

On leaving the Government Secure Intranet this email was certified virus free.
Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or
recorded for legal purposes.

Wrth adael Mewnwyd Ddiogel y Llywodraeth nid oedd unrhyw feirws yn
gysylltiedig â'r neges hon. Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd unrhyw ohebiaeth drwy'r
GSi yn cael ei logio, ei monitro a/neu ei chofnodi yn awtomatig am resymau
cyfreithiol.

From: Paul Murphy
Sent: 28 June 2017 09:51
To: Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Cc: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE
Division); Knight, Dewi (SAED)
Subject: Re: HEFCW

Dear Neil,

Fine by me , as long as they keep it to themselves!

I could give you a ring at 2pm, if that's ok? Could you remind me of the telephone
number?

Paul

Sent from my iPad

> On 28 Jun 2017, at 08:44, Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division) wrote:

>

> Dear Lord Murphy

>

> XXXXXX Redacted XXXXXXXXXX

>

> I am tied up until 1:00 today but happy to speak later if you need a word about how
yesterday's discussion went.

>

> Regards

>

> Neil

From: Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Sent: 05 July 2017 11:12
To: Lord MURPHY OF TORFAEN
Cc: Knight, Dewi (SAED); XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Draft XXXXXXXXXX

Dear Lord Murphy

XXXX – Redacted XXXXXXXX

Best wishes

Neil

Neil Surman

Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr / Deputy Director
Is-Adran Addysg Uwch / Higher Education Division
Cyfarwyddwr Grwp Sgiliau, Addysg Uwch a Dysgu Gydol Oes / Skills, Higher
Education
and Lifelong Learning
Llywodraeth Cymru / Welsh Government
Parc Cathays / Cathays Park
Caerdydd / Cardiff
CF10 3NQ

Any of the statements or comments made above should be regarded as personal and not those of the Welsh Assembly Government, any constituent part or connected body.

Dylai unrhyw ddatganiadau neu sylwadau a wneir uchod gael eu hystyried yn rhai personol ac nid yn rhai gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, unrhyw ran ohoni neu unrhyw gorff sy'n gysylltiedig â hi.

From: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Sent: 06 September 2017 11:21
To: MURPHY OF TORFAEN, Lord; Paul Murphy
Cc: XXX (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division); Surman, Neil (ESNR-SHELL -HE Division)
Subject: Re: Meeting with the First Minister, Kirsty Williams and Ken Skates

Dear Lord Murphy

I hope you are well and have had a lovely break over the summer.
We have been trying to arrange for you to meet with the First Minister, Kirsty Williams and Ken Skates. Private Office have suggested that the meeting take place in Ty Hywel building in Cardiff Bay at 14:30 on Wednesday 18 October. Is this date suitable for you?

Kind regards

Is-Adran Addysg Uwch/ Higher Education Division
Sgiliau, Addysg Uwch a Dysgu Gydol Oes/ Skills, Higher Education and Lifelong Learning

Request 6

The total amount of public money that has been spent (including staffing) relating to the Murphy Review.

Response:

Activity	Costs
Cost of the contract for writing the report on behalf of Lord Murphy	£26,325
Travel costs	£2,136.24
*Staffing costs	£16,386
Total	£44,847.24

*No dedicated staff were made available to support Lord Murphy in his review. A small amount of staff time was allocated to assist over the period of the review and the staffing costs provided are approximate average costs for staff time.