

Application No. DC/2016/01376

Location: Britannia Inn, 51 Frogmore Street, Abergavenny

Development: Removal of existing wand installation of higher floor above front room, retaining existing historic beams. Addition of new first floor above front room. Removal of existing and creation of new internal partitions, New glazed door to front of property, removal of existing signage, Alter colour scheme of façade.

Applicant: Sutton Property Group Ltd

Plans:

Rec 02/12/16

R247-00 Site Plan

R247-08 Existing elevations

Rec 12/01/17

R285 06A Existing plans

Rec 30/01/17

R285 07A Existing plans

R247- 09 C Proposed plans

R247-10A Proposed plans and elevations

Rec 31/01/17

R285- 13B Existing and Proposed sections 2-2

R285-12 C Existing and Proposed sections 1-1

Rec 01/02/17

R285 – 15 Proposed Sketch Detail

R285 -16 Proposed section 3-3

1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS

The Britannia Inn is located to the northern end of Frogmore Street where the street widens. The building is mid 19th Century in appearance, however the internal inspection suggests that the building has an earlier core. The ground floor public house has suffered significant alteration overtime however, to part the floor plan and some internal features still remain.

Three previous applications have granted permission for various internal alterations and the erection of a rear extension, together with lowering the sill of the ground floor windows to the front elevation. In addition consent has been granted for alterations to the rear of the building together with a link and construction of an additional building in the rear yard, designed to appear as an extension of the terrace to Baker Street

This application seeks further modifications to the building, including raising the internal floor structure which separates the ground and first floor spaces. It is important to note that there is a concurrent listed building consent application to remove the internal floor structure in question.

1.2 Conservation Designations:

2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

APPLICATION NUMBER	PROPOSAL	DECISION	
DC/2011/01207	Listed Building Consent – internal alterations, extension and lower window cills to gf front	Approved	03/02/12
DC/2011/01194	Planning permission – as above	Approved	06/02/12
DC/2012/00684	Listed Building Consent – Amendments to 01207- remove staircase	Approved	05/11/12
DC/2014/00371	Listed Building Consent – Amendments to 00684- internal alterations and inclusion of new build to rear	Approved	29/08/14
DC/2014/00367	Planning Permission – alterations to building and new build to rear	Approved	02/09/14
DC/2016/01380	Listed Building Consent – removal of internal floor structure	Current	

3.0 DEVELOPMENT PLAN

3.1 Monmouthshire Local Development Plan

Objective 5 relates to *Respecting Distinctiveness, Monmouthshire has a significant built heritage resource in terms of scheduled ancient monuments, listed buildings, conservation areas, historic parks and gardens and archaeologically sensitive site that, together with their settings, require protection and enhancement.*

The LDP seeks to influence these issues by:

- *Containing measures to preserve and enhance the cultural heritage and historic environment of Monmouthshire*
- *Playing a key role in promoting good sustainable design that will enable new development to respect and enhance distinctive character of Monmouthshire.*

Policy HE1 – Development in Conservation Areas

Within Conservation Areas, development proposals should, where appropriate, have regard to the Conservation Area Appraisal for that area and will be permitted if they preserve and enhance the architectural or historic character and appearance of the area and its landscape setting.

3.2 National Policy

Planning Policy Wales Chapter 6, Edition 9, Paragraph 6.5.11 states that with regards to listed buildings states that

'There should be a general presumption in favour of the preservation of a listed building and its setting, which might extend beyond its curtilage.'

Welsh Office Circular 61/96

In determining this application for Listed Building Consent particular attention will be given to the following guidance provided by this Welsh Office Circular.

1. Annexe D (Alterations to listed buildings: General Principles)
2. Appendix to Annex D, and

Annex F (Conditions for listed Building Consents)

4.0 REPRESENTATIONS

4.1 Consultation Replies

Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historic Monuments of Wales have not responded to the consultation

Abergavenny Town Council responded and recommended approval subject to all relevant conservation planning being met. Council recommend a site visit by the MCC planning department. .

GGAT have not responded to the consultation.

Ecology – responded stating that the building does have a high potential for bat roosting and although the surrounding vegetation quality is poor this does not outweigh the overall potential of the building to support bat species. The extent of the proposals would impact upon a roost if present and as such an assessment is required. Considering the open nature of the roof a preliminary bat roost assessment may be sufficient, however, subject to their findings and recommendations, dawn/dusk surveys may be required.

4.2 Neighbour Notification

Not applicable.

4.3 Other Responses

4.4 Local Member Views

None.

5. ISSUES/EVALUATION

- 5.1 The application seeks listed building consent for alterations to the Britannia which include raising the internal floor structure, alterations to the front door, string cornice above, new signage, internal re-organisation of partitions and alterations to the rear toilets. For clarity each of the elements of the proposals have been considered separately.
- 5.2 Raising of the internal floor structure: The application states that the client has not been able to rent the building in its current state...due to the changes in level, obstruction of the floor space and the low ceiling height. The statement goes on to add that the structural report concluded that the ceiling would not be able to meet commercial loadings, and that if it was to be retained that it would require strengthening works would be so extensive that the report suggests they would make the project commercially unviable. In addition a report from Newbridge Damp Proofing discovered timbers in the first floor were found to have been badly affected by wood boring insects and general decay that the whole section should be removed. The application also includes a historic building survey which states that the removal of the first floor would cause minimal amounts of 17th 18th C fabric to be removed including the existing beams which they concluded were not originally in their existing position. It is for these reasons that the application proposes to raise the floor.
- 5.3 Initially it was proposed to remove the whole floor structure entirely and have a full height open space. This was considered to be detrimental to the character of the building and it was advised that despite the issues with the current floor structure, the character and proportions of the space would be unacceptably affected with complete removal. It was therefore advised that, subject to details, and the unique circumstances of this particular case, that the floor structure could be raised. For information a separate application for the removal of the floor has been submitted. In normal circumstances it would not be considered appropriate to raise a historic floor structure. However, the building is in a poor state of repair and there has been no real signs improvement. In light of this, and taking into account the structural and infestation issues, it is considered that although the proposals put forward are not without their detriment but they do achieve a suitable compromise and a sustainable future for the building. This change does involve the loss of 90% of the existing floor structure. However, it does retain the principle beams which are considered to be of value dating from the 17th Century, albeit in a slightly higher position. The remaining floor structure dates from the 19th Century and whilst in most circumstances this would be considered of value and worthy of retention, given the structural issues it is regrettably lost.

- 5.3 The proposed new position of the floor was discussed in great detail, initially it was proposed to raise the floor up to create an internal space to the ground floor of 2.7m from the existing 2.1m in height resulting in a first floor space of 1.7m from 2.3m. It was considered that raising the floor 600mm created an overly high proportions to the room and conversely too low ceiling height to the first floor. This would result in a detrimental effect on the proportions of both spaces, compounded on the first floor by the windows being flush with the proposed floor finish. Following extensive negotiations it was considered that a compromise could be found where the floor level would be increased by 400 to 2.5m in the main part of the space and just under 2.2 at the underside of the main beam. This compromise is considered to address the issues raised and achieve a space that, once restored, will be attractive to potential occupiers and will achieve a sustainable future for the building.
- 5.4 The application included alterations to the front elevation of the building, including altering the 'string cornice' above the front windows and central door. It was requested that these proposals be omitted from the plans as there is no justification for the change and this would not improve the desirability of the building. It is welcomed that these elements have been removed from the proposals.
- 5.5 It is also important to consider the response from the bio-diversity colleagues. This requests further information in the form of a preliminary assessment and potential further dawn/dusk survey work. However, it is considered that the works to the building that may have the biggest impact to the potential favourable conservation status of the protected species have in the most part been approved via previous applications. These applications could, subject to conditions being discharged, be implemented now. Furthermore, in particular application ref DC/2014/00367, was also assessed for the potential impact on protected species where it was considered that the extensions to the rear of the building had 'negligible roosting features' and so no survey was required. On balance it is not considered that the condition of the building has changed sufficiently to warrant further investigation.
- 5.6 Overall the proposals put forward a significant scheme of alterations to the building that do affect the buildings character. However, following negotiations it is considered that this application achieves an appropriate resolution balancing the need to secure the buildings future with respecting the character of the designated listed building

6.0 Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015

The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales has been considered, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the WBFG Act). In reaching this recommendation, the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act have been taken into account and

it is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives set out in section 8 of the WBFG Act.

7.0 RECOMMENDATION:

Approve

8.0 CONDITIONS:

1. 5 Year time limit
2. All works of making good, all repair shall be on a like for like basis.
3. All work in accordance with the approved plans
4. No additional flues vents etc.
5. External timber shall have a painted finish, colour to be agreed.
6. All existing sash windows shall be repaired and reinstated.
7. 1:10 section details of any new windows shall be submitted to and agreed in writing.
8. 1:10 section details of all new internal and external doors, internal skirting's and architrave.
9. 1:20 section details including vertical and horizontal section of the proposed floor strengthening of the second floor structure, including additional beams.
10. 1:10 vertical and horizontal fire separation
11. Details of the proposed floor and ceiling finishes to the ground, first and second floors.
12. The internal walls of the building shall be plastered they shall not be left exposed. Full details of the proposed wall finishes to all internal walls to ground and first floor. All remaining areas shall be repaired on a like for like basis.
13. Details of the proposed new piers to the ground and first floor, including clarification of their finishing.

Informatives

If any archaeological resources are discovered GGAT are to be informed
Bats

Case Officer

Amy Longford

Date 01/01/17



Agreed Conservation Mgr

Date 02/02/17