



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

19th May 2017

Dear ,

ATISN 11235 - Assurance Review

Thank you for your email which I received on 10th April 2017 in which you requested:

- i) A copy of the Assurance Review completed into Sport Wales; and
- ii) Confirmation of whether Dr Paul Thomas was recommended for the role of chair of Sport Wales by the appointment panel, or whether the appointment was made against the advice of the appointment panel.

In relation to (i) the Welsh Government confirms that it holds information of that description and a copy of the information I have decided to release is enclosed.

I have decided that some of the information is exempt from disclosure under section 40(2) of the Freedom of Information Act as it amounts to the personal data of third parties and is therefore withheld. My reasoning for applying this exemption is set out in full at Annex 1 to this letter.

In relation to (ii) I can confirm that the interview panel assessed three individuals as appointable to the role of Chair of Sports Wales. One of the three appointable candidates was Dr Paul Thomas. The Minister was asked by the interview panel to select one of the appointable candidates for appointment. The Minister selected Dr Paul Thomas as the highest scoring of the three appointable candidates.



BUDDSODDWYR | INVESTORS
MEWN POBL | IN PEOPLE

Parc Cathays • Cathays Park
Caerdydd • Cardiff • CF10 3NQ

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First
Point of Contact Centre:
0300 0604400

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

If you are dissatisfied with the Welsh Government's handling of your request, you can ask for an internal review within 40 working days of the date of this response. Requests for an internal review should be addressed to the Welsh Government's Freedom of Information Officer at:

Information Rights Unit,
Welsh Government,
Cathays Park,
Cardiff,
CF10 3NQ

or Email: FreedomOfInformationOfficer@wales.gsi.gov.uk

Please remember to quote the ATISN reference number above.

You also have the right to complain to the Information Commissioner. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office,
Wycliffe House,
Water Lane,
Wilmslow,
Cheshire,
SK9 5AF.

However, please note that the Commissioner will not normally investigate a complaint until it has been through our own internal review process.

Yours sincerely

Annex 1. Section 40(2)

Section 40 of the Freedom of Information Act sets out an exemption from the right to know if the information requested is personal information protected by the Data Protection Act 1998 (DPA). Personal data is defined in Section 1(1) of the DPA as:

“personal data” means data which relates to a living individual who can be identified from those data; or from those data and other information which is in the possession of, or is likely to come into the possession of, the data controller.

We have concluded that, in this instance, the information requested contains third party personal data. Under Section 40(2) of the FOI Act, personal data is exempt from release if disclosure would breach one of the data protection principles. We consider the principle being most relevant in this instance as being the first.

The first data protection principle.

This states:

Personal data shall be processed fairly and lawfully and, in particular, shall not be processed unless—

(a) at least one of the conditions in Schedule 2 is met, and (b) in the case of sensitive personal data, at least one of the conditions in Schedule 3 is also met.

We consider that there is information in the report that clearly identifies third parties and so falls within the description of personal data as defined by the DPA and that its disclosure would breach the first data protection principle. The first data protection principle has two components:

1. Personal data shall be processed fairly and lawfully and
2. Personal data shall not be processed unless at least one of the conditions in DPA schedule 2 is met

Guidance from the Information Commissioner’s Office (Personal information (section 40 and regulation 13) v 1.3) states (at p11):

- *The starting point is to consider whether it would be fair to the data subject to disclose their personal data. The key considerations in assessing this are set out in the section on Fairness below.*
- *If disclosure would not be fair, then the information is exempt from disclosure.*

This approach was endorsed by the Court of Appeal in the case of Deborah Clark v the Information Commissioner and East Hertfordshire District Council where it was held:

“The first data protection principle entails a consideration of whether it would be fair to disclose the personal data in all the circumstances. The Commissioner determined that it would not be fair to disclose the requested information and thus the first data protection principle would be breached. There was no need in the present case therefore to consider whether any other Schedule 2 condition or conditions could be met because even if such conditions could be established, it would still not be possible to disclose the personal data without breaching the DPA” (paragraph 63).

In this instance, we do not believe that the other parties mentioned in the report would have any expectation, because of the circumstances under which the review was compiled, that their information would be made public. Thus, we believe release of this information would be unfair and so breach the first data protection principle. For that reason, the information is being withheld under section 40(2) of the Freedom of Information Act. This is an absolute exemption and not subject to the public interest tests.